



EMPLOYMENT OUTCOMES OF SKILLS TRAINING IN SOUTH ASIAN COUNTRIES: AN EVIDENCE SUMMARY

CONTEXTUALISATION OF REVIEW FINDINGS FOR INDIA AND NEPAL,
NOVEMBER, 2017

The authors of this report are:

P. Vigneswara Ilavarasan, PhD (Indian Institute of Technology Delhi)

Arpan Kumar Kar, PhD (Indian Institute of Technology Delhi)

Reema Aswani (Indian Institute of Technology Delhi)

Funding

This is an independent report commissioned under the DFID Systematic Review Programme for South Asia. This material has been funded by South Asia Research Hub, Research and Evidence Division, Department for International Development, Government of UK. The views expressed do not necessarily reflect the UK Government's official policies.

Acknowledgments

We would like to thank the following people who supported in undertaking the evidence summary:

Ms.Chavi Asrani (Indian Institute of Technology Delhi), Neha Rajpal, Pooja Singh, Dr Manoranjan Pattanayak (PwC India), Dr.Sujata Gamage (LIRNEasia), Erwin G A Alampay (Univ of Philipines), Dr.Shailendra Kumar Dwivedi (GIZ, India), NilushaKapugama (StaxInc, Sri Lanka), Dr.Sumedha Chauhan, PhD (Indian Institute of Management Rohtak), and Dr Mukdarut Bangpan and Claire Stansfield (Univ College of London). We thank PricewaterhouseCoopers Private Limited (PwC, India) for managing the DFID Systematic Review Programme for South Asia.

Conflicts of interest

There were no conflicts of interest in the writing of this report.

Contributions

The opinions expressed in this publication are not necessarily those of the UK Department for International Development, PwC, the EPPI-Centre, LIRNEasia or Indian Institute of Technology Delhi. Responsibility for the views expressed remains solely with the authors.

Citation

This report should be cited as: Ilavarasan, P.V., Kar, A.K. and Aswani, R. (2017). Employment outcomes of skills training in low and middle income South Asian countries: An evidence summary. London: EPPI-Centre, Social Science Research Unit, UCL Institute of Education, University College London.]

Picture

[The picture on the cover page has been taken by one of the team members during field visit to Coimbatore for a research project by P. Vigneswara Ilavarasan]

© Copyright

Authors of the systematic reviews on the EPPI-Centre website (<http://eppi.ioe.ac.uk/>) hold the copyright for the text of their reviews. The authors give permission for users of the review to display and print the contents of the review for their own non-commercial use, provided that the materials are not modified, copyright and other proprietary notices contained in the materials are retained, and the source of the material is cited clearly, following the citation details provided. Otherwise, users are not permitted to duplicate, reproduce, republish, distribute, or store the review without written permission.

CONTENTS

ABBREVIATIONS	Error! Bookmark not defined.
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	5
ABOUT THIS SUMMARY	5
APPROACH	5
CONTEXTUALISATION SUMMARY	5
BACKGROUND	7
METHODS	9
DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSIONS	10
INDIA	12
EMPLOYMENT AND TRAINING IN INDIA	12
SUMMARY OF CONTEXTUALISATION ANALYSIS	13
KEY MESSAGES FOR POLICY-MAKERS AND RESEARCHERS	13
NEPAL	15
EMPLOYMENT AND TRAINING IN NEPAL	15
SUMMARY OF CONTEXTUALISATION ANALYSIS	16
KEY MESSAGES FOR POLICY-MAKERS AND RESEARCHERS	16
REFERENCES	17
APPENDIX	20
APPENDIX 1:CHARACTERISTICS OF INCLUDED FINAL SYSTEMATIC REVIEWS	20

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Skills training programmes for improving employment related outcomes in South Asian Countries specifically India and Nepal appear to be successful. The impact as a whole seems to be positive and helps the trainees in employment initiation, sustenance, growth and setting up their own businesses. Although, the primary impact of the training programmes focuses on employment, there are several intermediary outcomes that include positive attitude, skill diversification, motivation and decision making.

ABOUT THIS SUMMARY

This is an independent report commissioned by the UK Department for International Development South Asia Research Hub (DFID-SARH) and funded by the Research and Evidence Division in the Department for International Development. This material has been funded by UK aid from the UK Government, however, the views expressed do not necessarily reflect the UK Government's official policies. The review aims to assess the evidence linking training interventions to employment outcomes in South Asian countries.

- The aim of the present report is to contextualise the findings of the evidence summary emerging out of eleven systematic reviews on employment outcomes of skills training in South Asian countries.
- The findings are contextualised for India and Nepal.
- This contextualisation report is expected to help the policy makers in India and Nepal to relate the findings and use them in their initiatives.

APPROACH

The contextualisation report is based on the evidence summary document prepared by synthesizing the findings from selected systematic reviews. The reviews were screened out from 40 resources comprising all possible academic databases and grey literature. A total of 5935 search results were obtained on the basis of finalised search keywords surrounding training, employment, focused countries and type of documents. The screening process to finalise the reviews included scrutinising title, abstract, full text and assessing quality through AMSTAR framework. The EPPI-reviewer software was used for the reviewing process. This report briefly presents the evidence summary on nature of training interventions and the employment outcomes for South Asian countries and contextualises for India and Nepal. The document is important as the national governments in the low income economies are striving to achieve national growth by utilising the manpower. The primary question of the summary is: What types of skills training have shown most impact on employment outcomes in Low and Middle Income countries, particularly in South Asia?

CONTEXTUALISATION SUMMARY

Several training interventions are being undertaken to improve the employment outcomes in South Asian countries specifically India and Nepal. This contextualisation report summarises the findings from 11 systematic reviews focusing on the employment and its related outcomes of training interventions in South Asia. The study has followed the processes of systematic review in searching multiple academic databases and grey literature. The search focused on specific training and employment terms including related words. The EPPI-reviewer software was used for screening the search results by applying inclusion/exclusion criteria.

The 11 systematic reviews were finalised after scrutinizing 5935 results from various sources. Though overall findings indicate that training programmes have a positive impact on employment outcomes, it is difficult to pinpoint a particular outcome and its strength in terms of summarised quantifiable effect size across the final reviews due to inadequate reporting in the final reviews. The training interventions seem to help the trainees in employment initiation, sustenance, growth and setting up their own businesses. Although, the primary impact of the training programmes focuses on employment, there are several intermediary outcomes that include positive attitude, skill diversification, motivation and decision making.

Out of the final reviews, it appears that professional and development training seems to have less impact when compared to others. It has impact only in two areas, Employment sustenance and self employment. Rest of the interventions have impact on four major outcomes out of five. Vocational skills and training has impact on employment inclination, employment sustenance and employment growth and status. The larger impact is seen in employment growth and status, with three different reviews.

Two types of interventions, medical counselling & rehabilitation and entrepreneurship training have impact on all outcomes, except employment inclination. In the order of priority, these two interventions could be taken first. However, action points from medical counselling and rehabilitation should be undertaken cautiously at least two reasons: systematic reviews are patronised by the medicine related domains than others and are likely to be available for evidence summary, and the amount of disabled people might be lower than other needy population sub groups. The best bet emerges to be entrepreneurship training with its impact on four of the outcomes.

For India and Nepal, policy makers could focus on the programmes promoting opportunities for self-employment and small scale entrepreneurial ventures as they lead to increase in labour market outcomes along with welfare gains. Provision of appropriate combinations of skills, capital, and counselling support based on the target audience's primary constraints is critical for achieving better results. The impacts on both labour market and business outcomes are significantly higher for youth making it relevant in developing countries aspiring to provide meaningful opportunities to their young populations. The performance of MSMEs can be improved and their size in terms of capital and staff be expanded through formalisation. The formalisation yields positive employment effects. The training interventions focusing on these elements show positive linkages. The young people in low and middle income countries (LMICs) gain benefit from TVET interventions. The communication skills intervention in Nepal could be beneficial for secondary employment related outcomes and help in employment

sustenance. Contextualisation shows an association between positive attitude of individuals and prior completion of a communication skills curriculum. Specific evidences from Kathmandu in Nepal show that higher education proves to be influential in changing attitudes towards corruption creating a healthy working environment.

BACKGROUND

An evidence summary to find what types of skills training have shown impact on employment outcomes in Low and Middle Income countries (LMICs), particularly in South Asia is conducted. This review is important for multiple reasons. The national governments in the under developed economies attempt to accomplish economic growth through competing challenges – building physical infrastructure to attract foreign investment, equipping local companies to deal incoming global competitions, balancing extant economic and social inequalities, and sustaining the democracy etc. The available manpower, sometimes in abundance, for instance in India, appears to be a solution for most of the above problems (Ansari & Wu, 2013; Cho et al., 2016).

A skilled labour pool is attractive to the business enterprises, both domestic and foreign. The increased employment evens out the economic inequalities which in turn bring societal balances. This desired realisation might be hampered by poor or unskilled labour in these economies (Glick et al., 2015). Apart from enabling transition of young people into the labour markets, governments also need to deal with job losses because of automation. In a seminal work on automation and its impact on employment, Frey & Osborne (2013) caution that more than half of the jobs in the developing world are to be displaced in coming years. In this case, governments need to tackle the impending unemployment.

Needless to say, national governments have inadequate resources to be spent on competing needs, for instance, building roads vs. skilling manpower. There is a need to understand what

works in all domains which require investment, especially manpower training and their impact. The outcomes of the proposed summary shall aid the policy makers in this regard.

Exclusive dependence on private firms for skills enhancement is not feasible, as many of them do not want to invest on training without having exclusive rights over the beneficiaries (Glick et al., 2015). With imperfections in the capital market, paying for training without collateral security or other supportive lending mechanisms, young population struggles equip or upgrade themselves. Those who are able to equip themselves using informal training mechanisms have problems in signalling their credentials in a formal set up. Training programmes that are customised to meet the local context might address the above problems.

The training programmes are of different types and are expected to impart skills to the participants. The nature of training (Sieben, 2007) can differ by intensity (incidence and duration), specificity (type of training, location and objectives) and funding (shared or self-financed). There are multiple training providers: commercial training private firms, individual private firms on fee sharing mode before jobs, public training institutes with subsidised fees, non-governmental organizations, trade associations and community organisations (Cho et al., 2016; Fullwiler & Meyeraan, 2010). The training focuses on all kinds of people categories – young, old, disadvantaged, mental or terminally ill patients, physically challenged, and school drop outs etc.

Cho et al. (2016) present at least five skills that are needed to strengthen entrepreneurship in the developing world – basic skills, technical skills, business skills, finance and non-cognitive skills. Some other skills like creativity or leadership skills for managers are also available (Subban & Vyas-Doorgapersad, 2014) or farming techniques (Waddington & White, 2014). These skills can be imparted in variety of settings - traditional class room training, workplace training including apprenticeship and on the job training. The training programmes can be exclusively customised for the participants or commoditised mass programmes. It is expected that basic skills are present among the trainees before moving into the advanced skills.

A systematic review (Kluve et al., 2016) found that people who were exposed to a youth employment intervention had better employment outcomes than those who were not. The nature of training programmes or interventions differed significantly between high income and low or middle income countries. Developed world had interventions implemented by the government when compared to small scale or targeted interventions implemented by the non-governmental organisations (NGOs) of the developing world. The impact in terms of employment and earnings is higher in the developing world. Out of the programmes, skills training and entrepreneurship interventions had greater income gain impacts than others. However, the study found greater variability in the results and called for further research.

The design of the programme seems to be affecting the outcomes (Glick et al., 2015). The major factors of success were participant profiling, monitored programme participation and incentives offered to programme participants and service providers. The effect of the programme is also better when the most disadvantaged youth were participants, irrespective

of the country income. Gender was not a clear differentiator in the potential outcome of the programmes. Also, there was no linkage between soft skills and employment outcomes. Other characteristics of the training that affect the outcomes when offered the employing firms include (Srimannarayana & Srimannarayana, 2016) number of trainees, training days, training costs, percentage of amount spent on training in payroll, feedback of participants, learning of the participants during training, transfer of learning on the job and satisfaction of line managers on training.

A meta regression analysis of entrepreneurship programmes in the developing world (Duncan & Gray, 1984; Honorati & Cho, 2013) highlighted the contextual environment of the programmes – different trainees benefit from different programmes in different locations. They suggested that vocational training needed to be offered along with other programmes like counselling or financing. An independent business training programme seemed to increase the earnings of the young beneficiaries. Vocational training and access to finance have larger impacts on labour market activity outcomes than other interventions. Higher education among the young participants had improved the business performance. Similar impact of education is observed in other studies as well (Marcotee, 2017). Programmes implemented through NGOs that were closely connected and familiar with beneficiaries had better effects. On the job training leads to less effective outcomes in certain situations (Barron et al., 2007).

To our best of knowledge, there is no exclusive evidence summary exists for South Asia on the proposed topic. The primary question of the summary shall be:

What types of skills training have shown most impact on employment outcomes in Low and Middle Income countries, particularly in South Asia?

The summary is expected to provide insights on the following:

- Who gives the training?
- What are the barriers and enablers for skills training to translate into employment outcomes?
- Is there differential impact with respect to intensity, specificity and funding of the training?
- In addition to employment outcomes, what are the other outcomes?
- What review level evidence is available on cost effectiveness of training programmes?

METHODS

The evidence summary is a review of systematic reviews. The systematic review is a novel methodology by which all the possible existing studies are found and synthesized (Ilavarasan, 2017). The search of reviews required for the evidence summary involved multiple stages. In the first stage, all material relevant, even marginally, to the evidence summary are collected from multiple sources, following set of keywords under three broad concepts: population, skills and training; and employment.

Under population, Afghanistan, Bangladesh, Bhutan, India, Nepal, Pakistan, and Sri Lanka are focused. Under skills, following keywords are used: vocational skills, behavioural skills, business skills, employment, employability, vocational skills, technical skills, technical training, soft skills training, skilfulness, ability, aptitude, capacity, talent, expertise, expertness, professionalism, proficiency, competence, efficiency, and know how.

Under training, the keywords used are: training, skills, rehabilitation, (technical and vocational education and training (TVET), teaching, instruction, coaching, tuition, tutoring, education, schooling, learning, lessons, discipline, preparation, grounding, drill, exercise, workout, working out, practice, apprenticeship, and therapy.

Under employment, following are the terms used for searching: employment, employ, job, work, recruit, position, post, occupation, situation, business, profession, vocation, trade, service, entrepreneurship, promotion, career, management, craft, enlistment, employ, engagement, hire, hiring, taking-on, recruitment, apprenticeship, and signing-up.

In each of the search combinations, 'review' or 'systematic review' is added to limit the results only to the reviews, not the individual empirical studies. Reviews published in 2000 and after, and in English are included.

The reviews are screened out from 40 resources comprising all possible academic databases and grey literature. A total of 5935 search results are obtained on the basis of finalised search keywords surrounding training, employment, focused countries and type of documents. The screening process to finalise the reviews included scrutinising title, abstract, full text and assessing quality through AMSTAR framework. The EPPI-reviewer software was used for the reviewing process. From each of the final reviews, relevant data are extracted and synthesized. The overall findings are summarised under two broad areas: training interventions and employment outcomes. A summary of the final systematic reviews is presented in Appendix 1.

DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSIONS

The evidence summary comprises of 11 systematic reviews focusing on various training interventions and their outcomes surrounding employment. The summary groups the training interventions into four groups namely (i) entrepreneurship training; (ii) medical, counselling and rehabilitation; (iii) vocational skills training; (iv) professional development training. The primary impact that is the impact on employment is also segregated into five groups: (i) employment inclination; (ii) employment initiation; (iii) employment sustenance; (iv) employment growth and status; and lastly (v) self-employment. Each study has specific focus on the type of training resulting in an impact in a single or multiple categories.

The impact as a whole seems to be positive and helps the trainees in employment initiation, sustenance, growth and setting up their own businesses. The studies included in this evidence had different employment related outcomes. Although, the primary impact of the training

programmes focuses on employment, there are several other outcomes including enhanced knowledge, positive attitude, skill diversification, change in attitude, behaviour and practices, motivation, career aspirations and better decision making abilities.

Employment inclination: When it comes to generating an inclination towards employment, training interventions livelihood and rural skills development have positive effect. Rehabilitation training motivated patients to start jobs post disability and injuries. Gaining jobs after entrepreneurial training is a lot easier with better knowledge and attitude & skills.

Employment sustenance: Under employment sustenance, different categories of training interventions including entrepreneurship training, medical, counselling and rehabilitation, vocational skills training and professional development training are present and help in sustaining current employment. Leadership & stress management trainings play an important role in maintaining jobs at clinics & hospitals. Food and workplace hygiene training for workers helps them in improving performance at their jobs. Medical training improves knowledge of health workers sustaining current job and improved performance at workplace with positive attitude and intent to work better.

Employment growth & Status: The employment growth and status are also affected by various interventions. Improved labour market outcomes are observed with vocational skills training. Vocational skills training is also known to increase individual earnings. Rehabilitation training motivated patients to get better employment post disability. MSME interventions catalysed the growth in employment and better status.

Self employment: financial and business training helps people (especially women) in taking loans & setting up a new business. Therapeutic interventions motivate people with disabilities to start their own business. Entrepreneurship interventions results in setting up new enterprises, businesses and start-up intent emerges.

Out of the final reviews, it appears that professional and development training seems to have less impact when compared to others. It has impact only in two areas, employment sustenance and self-employment. Rest of the interventions have impact on four major outcomes out of five. Vocational skills and training has impact on employment inclination, employment sustenance and employment growth and status. The larger impact is seen in employment growth and status, with three different reviews. Two types of interventions, medical counselling and rehabilitation and entrepreneurship training have impact on all outcomes, except employment inclination. In the order of priority, these two interventions should be taken first. However, action points from medical counselling and rehabilitation should be undertaken cautiously at least two reasons: systematic reviews are patronised by the medicine related domains than others and are likely to be available for evidence summary, and the amount of disabled people might be lower than other needy population sub groups. The best bet emerges to be entrepreneurship training with its impact on four of the outcomes.

EMPLOYMENT AND TRAINING IN INDIA

India is one of the fastest growing economies in the world, with 7% GDP growth rate in 2016-2017,¹ but with lower gross national income per capita, US\$ 1680 in 2016 compared to China's US\$ 8260.² Half of the present 1.3 billion people are expected to be below 26 years old in 2020,³ called as demographic dividend. However, the abundant labour shall turn into liability, if sufficient jobs are not found. According to ILO (2016), as of 2014-2015, there were about 472 million employed in the country. In 2013-2014, out of those above 15 years, labour force participation rate is 55.6%, with males doing much better, 76%, than women, 31%. Manufacturing sector contributes to 10.7% of the employment. Though overall unemployment rate is considered to be low, 2%, when compared to many low income countries, underemployment and inadequate skills plague the labour force. The labour force is predominantly consists of informal labour. The share of regular wage and salaried workers are only 15.4%. About 18% of the labour earn less than USD 1.9 per day, and about 35% of them earn between USD 1.9 and USD 3.10.

The Government of India is cognizant about the unemployment and skill gaps present in the country. The Ministry of Skill Development and Entrepreneurship was established in 2015 to focus on the emerging issues related to the skill interventions and employment. According to Govt of India⁴, only 2.3% of the workforce in India has undergone some kind of formal skill training. India's annual skilling capacity is approximately seven million which is inadequate when half of the population is employable one. The national skill development mission was created by the national government to address the skill training inadequacy issues. The implementation framework integrates the existing initiatives and provides strategic direction to state governments. All possible training providers can be engaged under this initiative.

There are three major units operate under this mission - (1) The National Skills Research Division (NSRD) - predominantly think tank; leverages expertise in private sector; and the functions include research, policy advisory / inputs, careers support, and knowledge exchange networks; (2) National Skill Development Corporation (NSDC) - support capacity building initiatives and private training partners; and (3) Directorate General of Training - responsible for training and apprenticeship; includes National Council for Vocational Training (NCVT) and Industrial Training Institute related domains.

¹ <https://www.ibef.org/economy/indiasnapshot/about-india-at-a-glance>

² <http://data.worldbank.org/indicator/NY.GNP.PCAP.CD>

³ <https://blogs.thomsonreuters.com/answeron/indias-demographic-dividend/>

⁴ <http://www.skilldevelopment.gov.in/assets/images/Mission%20booklet.pdf>

The government has set a target of up skilling 500 million people by 2022. Considering such high targets, it also becomes important to analyse the employment outcomes of such programmes in Indian scenario. This contextualisation report attempts to analyse the impact of existing programmes on employment related outcomes in India.

SUMMARY OF CONTEXTUALISATION ANALYSIS

When specifically talking about India, financial and business skills training impacts self-employment (business setup and taking loans) specifically empowering women in MSMEs (Cho & Honorati, 2014). In addition to this, training interventions on removing credit constraints of MSMEs along with entrepreneurship training are also known to benefit women and micro-enterprises with wage incentives and formalisation of processes at these firms. These interventions help towards the overall employment growth (Grimm & Paffhausen, 2015).

Studies considered in the evidence specifically focusing on hospital and food handlers highlight that training surrounding practical hand washing techniques with food and not workplace hygiene help these workers in maintaining their current employment better with increased knowledge, attitude, behaviour and practices at the workplace (Medeiros et al., 2011). In the similar context, surrounding health workers, interventions surrounding stress management are known to improve performance at work (Scott et al., 2016). These interventions help the health workers to sustain their current jobs better.

The contextualisation process further, provides specific evidences for people with disabilities and physical impairments. Studies specific to the Indian scenario illustrate that interventions surrounding vocational rehabilitation and functional independence motivate the people with disabilities to re-join their jobs again (Trenaman et al., 2014). Further, therapeutic interventions, assistive devices, community based rehabilitation and occupational rehabilitation services are also known to benefit people with physical impairments (specifically spinal-cord and mobility injuries), visual impairments or multiple form of impairments. These have direct employment related outcomes in terms of generating paid employment opportunities for these people including self-employment options. Such interventions have also lead to an increase in income for people with disabilities (Tripney et al., 2015).

The studies under consideration also target interventions for rural India and how it generates employment opportunities. Studies examine the effects of livelihood interventions for adolescent females in the slum areas of India (Tripney et al., 2013). Lastly, evidences also highlight the impact of tertiary education including skills training and employment services in the Indian context resulting in increased inclination towards employment, better earnings. However, these interventions are not as effective in rural areas (Oketch et al., 2014; Kluge et al., 2016).

KEY MESSAGES FOR POLICY-MAKERS AND RESEARCHERS

Out of the final reviews, it appears that professional and development training seems to have less impact when compared to others. It has impact only in two areas, employment sustenance and self-employment. Rest of the interventions have impact on four major outcomes out of five. Vocational skills and training has impact on employment inclination, employment sustenance and employment growth & status. The larger impact is seen in employment growth & status, with three different reviews. Two types of interventions, medical counselling & rehabilitation and entrepreneurship training have impact on all outcomes, except employment inclination. In the order of priority, these two interventions should be taken first. However, action points from medical counselling and rehabilitation should be undertaken cautiously at least two reasons: systematic reviews are patronised by the medicine related domains than others and are likely to be available for evidence summary, and the amount of disabled people might be lower than other needy population sub groups. The best bet emerges to be entrepreneurship training with its impact on four of the outcomes.

In the light of the reviews, following pointers surrounding the impact these interventions pertaining to the Indian context shall be useful for the policy makers:

- The programmes promoting opportunities for self employment and small scale entrepreneurial ventures lead to increases in labour market outcomes along with welfare gains.
- Provision of appropriate combinations of skills, capital, and counselling support based on the target audience's primary constraints is critical for achieving better results.
- The impacts on both labour market and business outcomes are significantly higher for youth making it relevant in developing countries aspiring to provide meaningful opportunities to their young populations.
- The performance of MSMEs can be improved and their size in terms of capital and staff be expanded through formalisation. The formalisation yields positive employment effects. The training interventions focusing on these elements show positive linkages.
- Young people in low and middle income countries (LMICs) gain benefit from TVET interventions.

EMPLOYMENT AND TRAINING IN NEPAL

Nepal is known to have a per capita income of about \$700 and is considered as one of the poorest countries of South Asia. The lack of employment opportunities is regarded as one of the primary reasons for the poverty. Nepal is severely affected by unemployment and underemployment. As per a recent report by Nepal CBS, the unemployment rate was 1.8% in the 1990s which has now increased to 2.1%. The primary employment sectors in Nepal comprise of agriculture and forestry (73.9%) and manufacturing (6.6%). Youth employment rates have also shown significant increase from 2.4% to 3.5%. The unemployment rate constitutes to about 20% for the people in the age group of 15-29 years. This compels the younger crowd to migrate overseas in search of appropriate employment opportunities. The government has responded to the severe unemployment scenario by initialising training and placement programmes for job services.

Vocational training and education programmes in Nepal have gained huge popularity over the past few years. These interventions have been among the primary policy decision agenda of the government. Further, these programmes are primarily aimed to generate employment opportunities by imparting desired skills to the trainee. Further, in Nepal, a wide variety of public and private TVET programmes are available to youth, women and specifically people with disabilities.

Further, youth unemployment has been seen as common driver of the conflict from which Nepal emerged in 2006. Since then international establishments have been investing hefty amounts in the TEVT sector. In addition to this, there are multiple concerns surrounding young women in the labour market. This is a result of the combination of age, low educational attainment, and norms around marriage and childbirth. The advocacy and investments on training opportunities have thus increased multi-fold because of several issues surrounding social exclusion of women, ethnic minorities, indigenous individuals, and other disadvantaged groups. Considering such high targets, it also becomes important to analyse the employment outcomes of such programs in Nepal. This contextualisation report attempts analyse the impact of existing programmes on employment related outcomes in Nepal.

The government also announced a policy in 2008 to address this rising problem of unemployment in Nepal. The Employment Fund (EF) provides authorisation to training programmes as a part of a bidding system which involves various training providers. The fund caters to plethora of training and employment programmes, ranging from formal TVET institutes to public and private training providers. The scheme is also followed by a Rapid Market Assessment (RMA) provision which helps in outlining feasible employment opportunities to the people (Chakravarty et al., 2016).

Another policy focusing on creating jobs to Nepali Youth under the Youth and Small Entrepreneur Self Employment Fund (YSEF). The fund has a provision of about 30,000 jobs every year by provided funds to the youth to start their own work. Along with the YSEF, the

Nepal government has also launched the Adolescent Girls Employment Initiative (AGEI) primarily focusing on employment for females. The SKILLS initiative envisioned under UNDP working with MoE and CTEVT to reform the TVET Policy 2012 has also worked towards labour market assessment in the agriculture sector.

SUMMARY OF CONTEXTUALISATION ANALYSIS

In the final systematic reviews, Nepal has not been studied adequately. When specifically talking about Nepal there seems to be a need for focus in specific professions of nursing. The summary reveals that inter-professional educational initiatives lead to improved communication, teamwork and appreciation of each other's roles at the workplace. Further, communication skills interventions prove to be beneficial for secondary employment related outcomes and help in employment sustenance. Contextualisation shows an association between positive attitude of individuals and prior completion of a communication skills curriculum (Scott et al., 2016). Specific evidences from Kathmandu in Nepal show that higher education proves to be influential in changing attitudes towards corruption creating a healthy working environment (Oketch et al., 2014).

KEY MESSAGES FOR POLICY-MAKERS AND RESEARCHERS

In the light of the reviews, following pointers surrounding the impact these interventions pertaining to Nepal shall be useful for the policy makers:

- Young people in low and middle income countries (LMICs) specifically Nepal gain benefit from TVET interventions. The existing government schemes are benefiting the youth and have positive impact for employment outcomes.
- Evidence summary reveals that inter-professional educational initiative lead to improved communication, teamwork and appreciation of each other's roles at the workplace. The extant interventions can focus on the same.
- Communication skills intervention in Nepal prove to be beneficial for secondary employment related outcomes and help in employment sustenance. Contextualisation shows an association between positive attitude of individuals and prior completion of a communication skills curriculum.
- Provision of appropriate combinations of skills, capital, and counselling support based on the target audience's primary constraints is critical for achieving better results.
- Specific evidences from Kathmandu in Nepal show that higher education proves to be influential in changing attitudes towards corruption creating a healthy working environment.

REFERENCES

- Ansari, B., & Wu, X. (2013). Development of Pakistan's Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET): an Analysis of Skilling Pakistan Reforms. *Journal of Technical Education and Training*, 5(2), 52–64.
- Barron, J. M., Berger, M. C., Black, D. A., Journal, T., & Spring, N. (2007). Do Workers Pay for On-The-Job Training ? Do Workers Pay for On-the-Job Training ?, 34(2), 235–252.
- Chakravarty, S., Lundberg, M. K., Danchev, P. N., & Zenker, J. (2016). The role of training programs for youth employment in Nepal: Impact evaluation report on the employment fund.
- Cho, Y., & Honorati, M. (2014). Entrepreneurship programs in developing countries: A meta regression analysis. *Labour Economics*, 28, 110-130.
- Cho, Y., Robalino, D., & Watson, S. (2016). Supporting self-employment and small-scale entrepreneurship: potential programs to improve livelihoods for vulnerable workers. *IZA Journal of Labour Policy*, 5(1), 7. <http://doi.org/10.1186/s40173-016-0060-2>
- Duncan, K. D., & Gray, M. J. (1984). UNCTIONAL CONTEXT TRAINING : A REVIEW AND AN APPLICATION TO A REFINERY CONTROL TASK, 226(4673), 466–468.
- Frey, C. B., & Osborne, M. (2013). *The Future of Employment: How susceptible are jobs to computerisation?* Oxford.
- Fullwiler, S. T., & Meyeraan, S. (2010). Confronting Poverty with Jobs and Job Training: A Northeast Iowa Case Study. *Journal of Economic Issues*, 44(4), 1073–1083. <http://doi.org/10.2753/JEI0021-3624440411>
- Glick, P., Huang, C., & Mejia, N. (2015). *The Private Sector and Youth Skills and Employment Programs in Low- and Middle-Income Countries*. World Bank. Retrieved from <http://documents.worldbank.org/curated/en/878201467987873644/The-private-sector-and-youth-skills-and-employment-programs-in-low-and-middle-income-countries>
- Grimm, M., & Paffhausen, A. L. (2015). Do interventions targeted at micro-entrepreneurs and small and medium-sized firms create jobs? A systematic review of the evidence for low and middle income countries. *Labour Economics*, 32, 67-85.
- Honorati, M., & Cho, Y. (2013). *Entrepreneurship Programs in Developing Countries : Entrepreneurship Programs in Developing Countries : A Meta Regression Analysis*, 28(7333), 1–42. <http://doi.org/10.1016/j.labeco.2014.03.011>
- Ilavarasan, P. V. (2017). Bridging ICTD research and policy-making: notes from a systematic review on MSMEs in the low-and middle-income countries. *Information Technology for Development*, 1-11.

- Kluve, J., Puerto, S., Robalino, D. A., Romero, J. M., Rother, F., Stöterau, J., ...& Witte, M. (2016). Do Youth Employment Programs Improve Labour Market Outcomes? A Systematic Review.
- Kluve, J., Puerto, S., Robalino, D., Rother, F., Weidenkaff, F., Stoeterau, J., ... Witte, M. (2016). Interventions to improve labour market outcomes of youth: A systematic review of training, entrepreneurship promotion, employment services, mentoring, and subsidized employment interventions, (August). Retrieved from <http://www.campbellcollaboration.org/lib/project/306/>
- Marcotee, E. D. (2017). Continuing Education , Job Training , and the Growth of Earnings Inequality. *Industrial Relations Review*, 53(4), 602–623.
- Medeiros, C. O., Cavalli, S. B., Salay, E., &Proença, R. P. C. (2011). Assessment of the methodological strategies adopted by food safety training programmes for food service workers: A systematic review. *Food Control*, 22(8), 1136-1144.
- Nabi, G., Liñán, F., Fayolle, A., Krueger, N., &Walmsley, A. (2017). The impact of entrepreneurship education in higher education: A systematic review and research agenda. *Academy of Management Learning & Education*, 16(2), 277-299.
- Nguyen, D. T. K., Leung, K. K., McIntyre, L., Ghali, W. A., &Sauve, R. (2013). Does integrated management of childhood illness (IMCI) training improve the skills of health workers? A systematic review and meta-analysis. *PloS one*, 8(6), e66030.
- Oketch, M., McCowan, T., &Schendel, R. (2014). The impact of tertiary education on development: A rigorous literature review. London: Department for International Development.
- Scott, J., Revera Morales, D., McRitchie, A., Riviello, R., Smink, D., & Yule, S. (2016). Non-technical skills and health care provision in low-and middle-income countries: a systematic review. *Medical education*, 50(4), 441-455.
- Sieben, I. (2007). Does training trigger turnover - or not?: The impact of formal training on graduates' job search behaviour. *Work, Employment & Society*, 21(3), 397–416. <http://doi.org/10.1177/0950017007080004>
- Srimannarayana, A. M., & Srimannarayana, M. (2016). Measuring Training & Development Published by : Shri Ram Centre for Industrial Relations and Human Resources Stable URL : <http://www.jstor.org/stable/23070559> Measuring Training & Development, 47(1), 117–125.
- Subban, M., & Vyas-Doorgapersad, S. (2014). Public Administration Training and Development in Africa: The Case of the Republic of South Africa. *Journal of Public Affairs Education*, 20(4), 499–514. Retrieved from <http://www.jstor.org/stable/24369834>

- Trenaman, L. M., Miller, W. C., & Escorpizo, R. (2014). Interventions for improving employment outcomes among individuals with spinal cord injury: a systematic review. *Spinal cord*, 52(11), 788-794.
- Tripney, J., Hombrados, J. G., Newman, M., Hovish, K., Brown, C., Steinka-Fry, K. T., & Wilkey, E. (2013). Post-basic technical and vocational education and training (TVET) interventions to improve employability and employment of TVET graduates in low- and middle-income countries: a systematic review. *Campbell Systematic Reviews*, 9(9).
- Tripney, J., Roulstone, A., Hoglebe, N., Vigurs, C., Schmidt, E., & Stewart, R. (2015). Interventions to Improve the Labour Market Situation of Adults with Physical and/or Sensory Disabilities in Low- and Middle-Income Countries: A Systematic Review. *Campbell Systematic Reviews*, 11(20).
- Waddington, H., & White, H. (2014). Farmer field schools: From agricultural extension to adult education. *3ie Systematic Review Summary 1*.

APPENDIX 1:CHARACTERISTICS OF INCLUDED FINAL SYSTEMATIC REVIEWS

The evidence summary consisted of eleven systematic reviews whose summary is presented below.

The first systematic review (Cho & Honorati, 2014) had six broad outcome categories including labour market activities, labour market income, business knowledge and practice, business performance, financial behaviour and attitudes. These categories covered primary as well as intermediate outcomes. The labour market activities included setting up business and its expansion, self employment, hours of work and business closing. The labour market income covered household income and assets, profits and salary earnings. The business knowledge and practice component comprised of innovation, access to network and accounting practices. The business performance outcome discussed the business expenses, sales and employee count information. The financial behaviour highlighted the loan and insurance outcomes. Lastly, the attitudes covered outcome targeting confidence and optimism along with the risk taking and time preferences benefits. The aspects surrounding decision making and incentives in wages was also a part of the outcome covered in this systematic review.

The primary focus of the second systematic review (Medeiros et al., 2011) is on methodological strategies adopted by food safety training programmes for food service workers. The outcomes are primarily focused on motivating health workers to introspect and perform better at workplace. The primary outcome is maintaining the employment with ongoing training programmes primarily for work place and food hygiene.

The third systematic review (Nabi et al., 2017) focuses on the following outcomes more specifically, the most common impact indicators are related to lower level indicators of subjective/ personal change: attitude, skills and knowledge, perceived feasibility and entrepreneurial intention. Further, in contrast with the low level indicators the study also highlights the outcomes in the form of higher level indicators of longer term, objective, or socioeconomic impact are much less frequent including start-ups and venture performance, both typically within 10 years of undertaking the entrepreneurship program.

The fourth systematic review (Nguyen et al., 2013) highlights the impact of integrated management of childhood illness (IMCI) training in improving skills of the health workers. The review highlights significant improvement when it comes to knowledge of the health workers but also states that the same is rarely affected in the performance of the workers at their workplaces. Further, it stated that the performance does not solely depend on the training intervention provided but also depends on various other factors including frequency and quality of supervision, health worker motivation, presence of additional funding and partnerships to sustain programs. The impact on employment is not direct but enhanced knowledge may have slight impact on sustaining current job .

The next included systematic review (Scott et al., 2016) uses non-technical skills training as the primary intervention which covers the following categories decision making, communication, teamwork, leadership and stress management. The overall impact is primarily centered surrounding the performance of the health workers. The positive impact states that post the training they can provide a more safe, effective and patient centric clinical care.

The next systematic review (Tripney et al., 2015) has several intermediate as well as primary outcomes. The intermediate outcomes are surrounding employment, education, attitudes/empowerment, health and quality of life. The other outcomes also included attitudes and behaviours. The primary outcomes in the other hand focused mainly on employment and income. When it comes to employment, the outcomes focused on initial employment, return to work, formal employment, working hours, job retention, promotion, job role/function changes. In the income category the outcomes included monthly earnings, weekly wages, hourly rate of pay and self-employment profits.

The systematic review by Grimm et al. (2015) focused on impact of interventions relevant to MSMEs on either changes in employment levels in these enterprises or the creation of new enterprises, including becoming self-employed. There are also studies that assess the impact on both outcomes which were then also both used. Most of these impacts (about 60%) relate to employment. The remaining impacts measure business creation and self-employment. The study also provided information regarding the impact on investment, hours worked, productivity, output, sales, revenues and profits. These are the intermediate outcomes of the review.

The next included systematic review (Kluve et al., 2016) analyze the impact of youth employment programs for improving labour market outcomes. The primary outcome focuses on better employment services and inclination towards employment. The intermediate outcomes target motivation, career aspirations and improved decision making.

The systematic review by Trenman et al. (2014) focuses on rehabilitation training interventions for the disabled. The overall outcomes primarily focus on paid employment, self employment, employment in integrated competitive employment settings, competitive employment in the community earning at least minimum wage; earnings as a result of employment, workplace support, rate of return to work and change in employment status.

The next (Oketch et al., 2014) included studies that target the impact of tertiary education on the development. The developmental impact can be categorised into impact on earnings, economic growth, health and nutrition, women empowerment and public services. The impact of specific studies using the countries under focus is on increasing earnings which is positive and in rural areas having insignificant impact.

The last review (Tripney et al., 2013) is on the following interventions: technical education, vocational education, vocational training, on-the-job training and apprenticeship training. The

intermediate outcomes are also divided into employment and employability. The employment outcomes target job searches, applications and interviews. On the other, the employability outcomes focus on skills (e.g., vocational/technical), qualifications, attitudes to work, career aspirations, work-related confidence, work-related self-esteem, motivation (e.g., to find work, to secure promotion at work), job search skills, career management skills, job performance, employee productivity and job satisfaction. the long term outcomes/primary impacts focused in the systematic review include gaining initial employment, re-entering employment, obtaining 'better' employment (e.g., through promotion or gaining employment in the formal sector), self-employment (starting a new business or expanding one), working hours and payments (i.e., earnings, wages, salary or income). The table below summarises the reviews.

Review	Year	Focused Countries	Research subjects	Training	Training providers	Employment related outcome	Other outcomes
1 – Cho et al., (2014)	2014	Total 37 studies, South Asia - 10 (India 5, Sri Lanka 3, Bangladesh 1, Pakistan 1)	Women SMEs (India), microenterprise owners (Sri Lanka), micro finance clients (Pakistan and Bangladesh)	Financial and business skills training, counselling	Not mentioned in SR	Self employment (business setup and taking loans), Women empowerment	Knowledge
2 – Medeiros et al., (2011)	2011	Total 13 (India - 2)	Hospital and Service unit food handlers	Practical hand washing techniques; Food and workplace hygiene.	Public funded institution	Maintaining employment	Knowledge, attitudes, behaviour and practices at the workplace
3 – Nabi et al., (2016)	2017	Total - 73 (No details on South Asia)	Undergraduate, postgraduate or alumni or unspecified university students. The majority studied entrepreneurship and business or business combination courses	Entrepreneurship education	Not mentioned in SR	Gaining initial employment post higher education	Attitude, Skills and knowledge, Entrepreneurial intention, Business start up, performance.
4 – Nguyen et al., (2013)	2013	Total 26 studies (Bangladesh-1, Pakistan-1)	Health workers	Management, Feeding counselling	Not mentioned	Not related to employment for these studies	Not reported
5 – Scott et al., (2016)	2016	Total - 21, Asia-7 (Afghanistan-1, Sri Lanka-1, India-1, Pakistan-1, Nepal-3)	Residents (India and Pakistan), Nurses and nursing & medical students (Nepal), medical students (Sri Lanka), Doctors (Afghanistan)	Stress Management (India and Pakistan), Leadership, Communication Skills and Teamwork (Nepal), Communications skills (Sri Lanka), Decision Making (Afghanistan)	Not mentioned in SR	Better performance at work place (Clinics, hospitals)	Safe, effective and patient centred clinical care

6 – Tripney et al., (2015)	2015	Total - 14 (India-4, Bangladesh- 3)	Physical impairments (spinal cord and mobility), multiple impairments, visual impairments	Therapeutic interventions, assistive devices, community based rehabilitation and occupational rehabilitation services	Not mentioned in the systematic review	Self employment, better income, Paid employment for people with disabilities	Not reported
7 – Grimm et al., (2015)	2015	Total - 53 (India-4, Sri-Lanka-5, Pakistan-1)	Mostly women, micro enterprises	Training on removing credit constraints of micro-, small and medium-sized firms including entrepreneurship training.	Not mentioned in the study	Employment Growth; New enterprise formation	Formalization of processes in firms, Wage incentives
8 – Kluge et al., (2016)	2016	Total - 113 (India-3)	No disaggregated details	Skills training and employment services	Livelihoods Training for Adolescent Living, Satya/Pratham programme and BPO recruiting services.	Inclination towards employment, better employment services.	Motivation, career aspirations, decision making
9 – Trenaman et al., (2014)	2014	Total - 14 (India-1)	People with disabilities, 40 males with SCI, 6 females with SCI. No other demographics given.	Vocational rehabilitation, functional independence.	Not reported	Rejoining the employment after rehabilitation	Change in status of employment
10 – Oketch et al., (2014)	2014	Total 66 (India-15, Pakistan-12, Sri Lanka-3, Nepal-2, Bangladesh-2)	No details	Tertiary education including technical and vocational training	Not reported	Increased individual earnings but lacks impact in rural areas.	
11 – Tripney et al., (2013)	2013	Total - 26 (India-1, Bhutan -1)	1. adolescent (14-19 year old) female slum residents in the Indian city of Allahabad 2.	TVET Trainings: reproductive health training sessions, vocational counselling & vocational training, savings	NGOs	Inclination towards employment	Motivation, career aspirations, skill diversification

			Rural residents (all ages) living in poverty	formation information, and follow-up support from a peer educator; tailoring, mehndi, creative painting, dhari, mending and embroidery, candle making, silver ornament and link making, pot decoration, crochet, jute doll making, basic cooking, personal grooming, and fabric painting; carpentry, masonry, plumbing, and house wiring.			
--	--	--	--	---	--	--	--

ABBREVIATIONS

- IIT - Indian Institute of Technology
- MSMEs - Micro, Small and Medium Enterprises
- NGOs - Non Governmental Organizations
- LMIC - Low and middle income countries
- PICO - Population, Interventions, Comparison, and Outcomes.
- SR - Systematic Review
- TVET - Technical and vocational education and training.
- SKILLS - Support to Knowledge and Lifelong Learning Skills
- YSEF - Youth and Small Entrepreneur Self Employment Fund

AGEI	-	Adolescent Girls Employment Initiative
EF	-	Employment Fund
ITI	-	Industrial Training Institutes
ICT	-	Industrial Training Centers
NSDM	-	National Skill Development Mission
BSE	-	Bombay Stock Exchange
CBS	-	Central Bureau of Statistics
NCVT	-	National Council for Vocational Training
NSDC	-	National Skill Development Corporation
NSRD	-	National Skills Research Division
UNDP	-	United Nations Development Programme

